Standards & Guidelines
For Design Review

Piedmont Preservation
Ken Kocher
Design Guidelines can not magically answer COA applications
Provide direction to the Goals of local preservation
Provide direction to the Goals of local preservation
• Answer the easy questions

• Answer some of the hard questions

• Educate and inform

• Add Legitimacy
Know how guidelines are “built”
Local Design Guidelines

Secretary’s Standards

Preservation Philosophy
Preservation Philosophy:

“The Building Site”
Scrape vs. Anti-scrape
Eugene-Emanuel Viollet-le-duc
“To restore an edifice means neither to maintain it, nor to repair it, nor to rebuild it; it means to reestablish it in a condition of completeness, which may in fact never have actually existed at any given time.”
which may in fact never have actually existed at any given time
John Ruskin
“[Restoration] means the most total destruction which a building can suffer: a destruction out of which no remnants can be gathered; a destruction accompanied with false description of the thing destroyed.”
false
description of
the thing
destroyed
Federal Government enters into Preservation
Need to articulate a regulatory preservation philosophy.
Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Historic Preservation Projects
Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Historic Preservation Projects
Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties
Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Preservation
Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Restoration
National Alliance of Preservation Commissions

ELKINS, WEST VIRGINIA

COMMISSION ASSISTANCE & MENTORING PROGRAM

Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Reconstruction
Secretary of the \textit{Interior’s} Standards for Rehabilitation
Secretary of the Interior’s Standards
Rehabilitation

Reader’s Digest 65

Time Magazine 52

Harvard Law Review low 30s
Secretary of the Interior’s Standards

Rehabilitation

28.6
Secretary of the Interior’s Standards

Rehabilitation

#1 - A property shall be used for its historic purpose or be placed in a new use that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment.
Don’t Bite Off More Than You Can Chew
National Alliance of Preservation Commissions
ELKINS, WEST VIRGINIA

COMMISSION ASSISTANCE & MENTORING PROGRAM
Secretary of the Interior’s Standards

Rehabilitation

#2 - The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterizes a property shall be avoided.
Dance with the one that brought you.
Secretary of the Interior’s Standards

Rehabilitation

#3 - Each property shall be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken.
A Half Truth Is A Whole Lie
Don’t Gild The Lily
COMMISSION ASSISTANCE & MENTORING PROGRAM
Secretary of the Interior’s Standards

Rehabilitation

#4 - Most properties change over time; those changes that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved.
Don’t Throw The Baby Out With The Bath Water
Secretary of the Interior’s Standards

Rehabilitation

#5 - Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved.
If It Ain’t Broke, Don’t Fix It
Secretary of the Interior’s Standards

Rehabilitation

#6 - Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.
All That Glitters Is Not Gold
Look Before You Leap

http://loschistes.com
Secretary of the Interior’s Standards

Rehabilitation

#7 - Chemical or physical treatments, such as sandblasting, that cause damage to historic materials shall not be used. The surface cleaning of structures, if appropriate, shall be undertaken using the gentlest means possible.
Don’t Use A Hammer When A Fly-swatter Will Do
Don’t Use A Hammer When A Fly-swatter Will Do
COMMISSION ASSISTANCE & MENTORING PROGRAM
Secretary of the Interior’s Standards

Rehabilitation

#8 - Significant archeological resources affected by a project shall be protected and preserved. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures shall be undertaken.
Let Sleeping Dogs Lie
Call Before You Dig
Secretary of the Interior’s Standards

Rehabilitation

#9 - New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.
Don’t Let the Tail Wag The Dog

©Linda Silvestri
Let's get matchy matchy.

Don’t Be Too Matchy-Matchy
National Alliance of Preservation Commissions
ELKINS, WEST VIRGINIA

COMMISSION ASSISTANCE & MENTORING PROGRAM
Secretary of the Interior’s Standards

Rehabilitation

#10 - New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.
An Ounce Of Prevention

Is Worth A Pound Of Cure
Positive: Written Broadly
Negative:
Written
Broadly
### LAUNDRY LIST

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Price</th>
<th>TOTAL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Trousers/Pants/Slacks/Skirts</td>
<td></td>
<td>$4.00</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shirts/Blouses</td>
<td></td>
<td>$3.00</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Formal Shirts/Special</td>
<td></td>
<td>$3.75</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Polo Shirts/Color T-Shirts</td>
<td></td>
<td>$2.25</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shorts</td>
<td></td>
<td>$2.50</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Undershirts/Singlets/White T-Shirts</td>
<td></td>
<td>$1.25</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Undershorts/Panties</td>
<td></td>
<td>$1.00</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Slips</td>
<td></td>
<td>$2.00</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brassieres</td>
<td></td>
<td>$1.50</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Handkerchiefs</td>
<td></td>
<td>$0.75</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Socks</td>
<td></td>
<td>$1.00</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nightgowns/Pajamas</td>
<td></td>
<td>$3.25</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sweatsuits</td>
<td></td>
<td>$3.50</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jumpsuits</td>
<td></td>
<td>$4.50</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Subtotal</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>$</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

For shirts only: Start from the top.

**Special Instructions:**
What People Need

One fish
two fish
red fish
blue fish
Local Guidelines should build upon the Standards and accepted philosophy
Local Philosophy should develop over time and be expressed through Guidelines.
Porches - 1.6

Porches are a combination of roof, roof supports, flooring, foundation, and stylistic details. On valuable buildings, stylistic expression is often limited to the porch area. Because of their significance, changes to porches, especially front porches, should be carefully considered to ensure the impact to historic material, details, meaning and

a.4 Rear porches may be enclosed with solid materials (discouraged)

d. New porches must
   impact the form; should be simple; and in
   keeping with the scale, period, and style of the house

e. See Roof, Materials & Details, and Foundations
   for further guidelines

f. See Modern Features for
   guidelines on decks

* see examples in appendix

a.1 Inappropriate porch enclosure

Rehabilitation

be
Comprehensive Assistance & Mentoring Program

Elkins, West Virginia

Rehabilitation

1. Some porches, though not original, have become historically significant and should be preserved.
Effective use of Standards and Guidelines depends on Findings of Fact.
Proposal:
Remove Paint From An 1870 Brick Historic Building
Finding: the building is constructed of 19th century brick which sandblasting would damage.
Conflicts with:
Guideline 4.5.1
“Sandblasting will not be used”
Proposal:
Replace Nonhistoric Windows On 1890s House
Finding: materials, size, scale, and proportion are not compatible with the house.
Conflicts with:
Standard 9
“New work will be compatible…”
OH! Yeah! – Other Stuff

- Explain the Process
- Outline District History
- Showcase Architecture
- Provide A Glossary
- Note Resources
# OUTBUILDINGS

Outbuildings - also known as dependencies, secondary structures, and accessory buildings - are traditional components of historic properties. Historically, many household functions were relegated to outbuildings in the yard. Kitchens, carriage houses, and garages, smokehouses, privies, storage sheds, and laundry sheds were common components of residential landscapes. Life-style changes and modern conveniences rendered many of these structures obsolete, and many have all but vanished from the modern landscape. In many cases, the few historic outbuildings that remain are important indicators of the town’s development and should be preserved. New outbuildings should follow the established patterns and should not significantly decrease the open space of the site.

## THE BASICS

### Visual Characteristics

Site Arrangement (see plans)
1. **Placement**: Where will the outbuilding be located?
2. **Orientation**: Which direction does the outbuilding face?
3. **Coverage**: What will its dimensions and building area be?
4. **Site Features**: What is the building’s spatial relationship to the primary structure? Where will additional site features (fences, pavements, etc.) be located in relation to the outbuilding? Architectural Design (character and description of materials)
5. **Scale**: What size is the outbuilding - height, width, and depth?
6. **Form**: How is the outbuilding shaped?
7. **Facade**: What is the outbuilding’s shape (wall-to-wall opening)?
8. **Materials**: What construction materials will be used?
9. **Details**: What is the architectural style of the primary building and other visual qualities.

### Preservation Pointers

**Historic Outbuildings** should be preserved and maintained.

**Preservation Outbuildings** should be preserved and maintained.

**Historic Outbuildings** materials should be replaced rather than replaced. If replacement is required, new materials should match the original materials in composition, design, color, texture, and other visual qualities.

**Historic Outbuildings** should not be relocated.

**New Outbuildings** may be designed in contemporary and existing historic examples. Exact replication of historic outbuildings should be avoided. New outbuildings should not be attached to the primary structure (either directly or by a temporary structure).

**Preservation Outbuildings** are not incompatible so, only those that fail to meet the established design criteria are inappropriate.

**Reconstruction of outbuildings** that are clearly documented may be permitted for the original site. Provided that all aspects of the size and outbuilding clearly approximate that of the original.

Outbuildings smaller than 20x20 ft. that are not visible from the public right-of-way qualify as administrative income items.

---

## THE GUIDELINES

### Site Arrangement

- **Placement**: Outbuildings should not be placed in front of any historic building. Generally, new outbuildings should be placed to the rear of the primary building in a manner consistent with traditional placement patterns.
- **Orientation**: Outbuildings should follow the established orientation pattern of similar historic outbuildings.
- **Coverage**: Including outbuildings, lot coverage should not exceed 60% of the total property area.

### Architectural Design

- **Scale**: Outbuildings should respect the scale of the primary building and historic precedent for similar buildings. Outbuildings should be secondary to the primary building. The total square footage for all outbuildings should not exceed more than 50% of the square footage of the primary building.
- **Form**: Outbuildings should reflect the form of the similar historic outbuildings, roof pitch, foundation, floor-to-ceiling height, and key design.

### Materials

Outbuildings should follow the precedent established by the primary building, matching in both material and appearance.

### Details

Ornamentation of outbuildings should not exceed the degree of ornamentation on the historic structure. Ornamentation from the primary building is to be repeated on the outbuilding, the ornamentation may be an underplayed or abstract interpretation.
**Architectural Design**

**Scale**
Outbuildings should respect the scale of the primary building and historic precedent for similar dependencies. Outbuildings should be secondary to the primary building. The total square footage for all outbuildings should not exceed more than 50% of square footage of the primary building.

**Form**
Outbuildings should respect the form of the similar historic outbuildings, roof pitch, foundation/floor-to-ceiling heights, and bay divisions.
COMMISSION ASSISTANCE & MENTORING PROGRAM

ELKINS, WEST VIRGINIA
COMMISSION ASSISTANCE & MENTORING PROGRAM

FRONT ELEVATION - CARRIAGE HOUSE
SCALE: 1/4" = 1'-0"
COMMISSION ASSISTANCE & MENTORING PROGRAM

National Alliance of Preservation Commissions

ELKINS, WEST VIRGINIA
National Alliance of Preservation Commissions
ELKINS, WEST VIRGINIA

COMMISSION ASSISTANCE & MENTORING PROGRAM
Traditionally, Madison garages have been small, utilitarian structures such as these examples in the historic district.

Garages like other outbuildings have a long history in Madison. Early car owners often opted to store their autos in commercial garages; at least three were constructed in downtown Madison. Later, as car ownership became more prevalent, garages began to appear on Madison’s residential properties. A few early garages were converted stables; however, this was not the norm as most were simple, agricultural structures and ill-suited for use as garages. Contrary to popular belief, the town had few if any carriage houses. Historically, Madison’s garages were small, simple buildings just large enough to house a single automobile.

Many of today’s automobiles are much larger than those of the past and families often own several cars. This plus the want for additional square footage has led to garage designs which are not compatible with the character of Madison’s Historic District. As with all new outbuildings, garages should be secondary to the house. Proposed designs should strive to limit scale as much as possible following the example of historic garage structures.

Despite the impression that they are “historical,” large, elaborate carriage house designs are not part of Madison’s heritage and would be inappropriate additions to the historic district.

1927 Sanborn Fire Insurance map showing garages in Madison - note the placement and size relative to the house.
THE GUIDELINES

Traditional Garage Form
- Placement: behind the house, orientation to the street preferred for 1-car garages, orientation to side street preferred on corner lots
- Size Limits: 1 car: 14' x 24' footprint/14' height; 2 car: 22' x 24' footprint/18' height; 3 car: 30' x 24' footprint/18' height
- Main Form: 1 car: front gable or hip; 2 car: front gable, side gable, or hip; 3 car: front gable, side gable, or hip
- Add-ons: 1 car: one side shed and/or rear shed, no dormers; 2 car: one shed OR one dormer; 3 car: no sheds, no dormers
- Materials: Roof: metal (preferred), composition shingles, exposed rafters preferred; Siding: lap board (wood or smooth fiber-cement) with a 3 1/2 - 5 1/2" reveal (exposed width), vertical board (wood or fiber-cement); doors: plank or panel, may be painted metal
- Details: None (no shutters, window boxes, sawnwork, cupolas, etc.); garage door openings should be single car opening (or appear to be so) and dog-eared or squared – not arched; avoid Colonial type hinges; windows (placement and design) should be typical of historic garages; exterior lights; utilitarian lights (no carriage lamps)

Outbuilding/Barn Form
- Modeling existing historic structures encouraged, mass and scale appropriate to the house (i.e., two story vs. one story), appropriate to the age of the house; greater distance from the house than garages – especially for larger structures; metal or wood shingle roofing preferred; vertical wood cladding (stained or weathered preferred)

Integrated Garages with New Primary Structures
- Placed behind the main structure, doors should have low visibility – facing the side or rear property line
- Constructed as an ell to the main house – not located under main roof form
- Hyphen attachment allowed for semi-detached structures, should substantially follow other garage guidelines

Carports
- Not approved in the historic district.

Please refer to the OUTBUILDINGS criteria sheet for further guidance.

1. Third bay must be offset from the main wall plane at least 1'
2. Avoid steeply pitched roofs
3. Sheds limited to 7' in depth; roof should tie into main roof in a traditional manner
4. Both a dormer and a shed on an elevation with little to no visibility may be considered
5. Refers to a solid, enclosed structure (does not include breezeways)